



Epping Forest District Council

EFDC



EFDC

Unauthorised reproduction infringes Crown Copyright and may lead to prosecution or civil proceedings.

Contains Ordnance Survey Data. © Crown Copyright 2013 EFDC License No: 100018534

Contains Royal Mail Data. © Royal Mail Copyright & Database Right 2013

Application Number:	EPF/0760/23
Site Name:	5, Staples Road, Loughton, IG10 1HP

OFFICER REPORT

Application Ref: EPF/0760/23
Application Type: Householder planning permission
Applicant: Mr Jake Marshall
Case Officer: Muhammad Rahman
Site Address: 5, Staples Road, Loughton, IG10 1HP
Proposal: Replacement front door and surround
Ward: Loughton St. Mary's
Parish: Loughton
View Plans: <https://eppingforestdcpr.force.com/pr/s/planning-application/a0h8d000001Vq5e>
Recommendation: Refuse

This application is before this Committee since the application is objected to by Councillor Chris Pond in a purely personal capacity; (Pursuant to The Constitution, Article 10 District Development Management Committee and Area Plans Sub-Committees)

Site and Surroundings

The site comprises of a detached house, located within the Staples Road Conservation Area. It also lies within an Article 4 direction area which restricts the scope of permitted development rights.

The property itself is not listed, nor locally listed, although it is recognised as a Key Building of Townscape Merit within the Staples Road Conservation Area Appraisal, and both properties on either side (No's 3 & 7) are locally listed.

Proposal

The proposal is for a replacement front door and surround.

Relevant Planning History

EPF/2486/19 - Ground and lower ground floor rear renovation and extension – Allowed at Appeal

PRE/0134/22 - Pre application for a proposed installation of x8 no. solar panels on the flat roof of the new extension currently being constructed at the back of the property (ref: EPF/2486/19 - Advice Given

EPF/1519/22 - Approval of Details Reserved by Condition 3 'Details of external materials' of EPF/2486/19 (Ground and lower ground floor rear renovation and extension) – Details Approved

EPF/0724/23 - Re- design of the front garden – Concurrent

Development Plan Context

Epping Forest Local Plan 2011-2033 (2023);

On 9 February 2023, the council received the Inspector's Report on the Examination of the Epping Forest District Local Plan 2011 to 2033. The Inspector's Report concludes that subject to the Main Modifications set out in the appendix to the report, the Epping Forest District Local Plan 2011 to 2033 satisfies the requirements of Section 20(5) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and meets the criteria for soundness as set out in the National Planning Policy Framework and is capable of

adoption. The proposed adoption of the Epping Forest District Local Plan 2011 to 2033 was considered at an Extraordinary Meeting of the Council held on 6 March 2023 and formally adopted by the Council.

The following policies within the current Development Plan are considered to be of relevance to this application:

DM7 Heritage Assets
DM9 High Quality Design

National Planning Policy Framework 2021 (Framework)

The Framework is a material consideration in determining planning applications. The following paragraphs are considered to be of relevance to this application:

Paragraphs 126 & 130

Summary of Representations

Number of neighbours Consulted: 11. 1 response(s) received.
Site notice posted: Yes.

7 STAPLES ROAD – Objection - The doors, windows and other architectural features of the houses in Staples Rd are virtually all original and are specially so approved of and noted in the EFDC Conservation Area Appraisal. They are the main reason Staples Rd was designated a conservation area 30 years ago.

The front door to no5 is original handwork of the 1880s. It is crafted with crossfill tongue & groove and stop-chamfered panels and is thus very characteristic of its time. It is a building of Townscape Merit and nos 3 and 7 are locally listed.

My main observation is that the proposal is entirely unnecessary and would detract in a small way from the attractions and merits of the conservation area. If the door, which suites that of my house adjacent, is defective, it should be refurbished. Therefore, I believe the application should not be consented.

LRA PLANS GROUP – Objection - We understand Staples Road was designated a conservation area precisely because of all the unchanged details; thus the Article 4 Direction, which removes the permitted development rights on doors. The front door is the same design as that on no 7, built by same builder at the same time; it is four panelled, cross-filled and stop-chamfered. No 5 has had a letterplate fitted; but No 7 never has.

Unless there is some justification for the replacement door other than change for change's sake, we consider the original fabric should be retained to preserve the special character of the conservation area. These losses can add up and lead to a creeping erosion of the conservation area unless the change can be justified as a necessary change.

LOUGHTON TOWN COUNCIL – The Committee OBJECTED to this application believing Staples Road was designated a conservation area because virtually all the doors, windows and other architectural features of the houses are original. Thus, the Article 4 Direction, which removes the permitted development rights on doors. The front door is the same design as that on no 7, built by the same builder at the same time; it is four panelled, cross-filled tongue and groove and stop chamfered. No 5 has had a letterplate fitted; but No 7 never has.

Unless there is some justification for the replacement door other than change for change's sake, the Committee consider the original fabric should be retained to preserve the special character of the

conservation area. These losses can add up and lead to a creeping erosion of the conservation area unless the change can be justified as a necessary change.

Planning Considerations

The main issue for consideration in this case is the impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation area and its setting.

On this note, the Councils Conservation Officer has provided the following comments below;

Context & Significance

No.5 Staples Road ('Forest Lodge'; f.k.a. 'Glendower') is a detached 19th century house located within the Staples Road Conservation Area. The building is recognised as a 'Key Building of Townscape Merit' within the Staples Road CA Character Appraisal (2014), and its two neighbouring dwellings are both Locally Listed Buildings (LLBs). The attractive landmark building of the site was constructed by local builder George Beckett in 1882 along with its neighbour, no.7 ('Forest Retreat' / 'Forest Villa'), in a similar form and layout. The special interest of the wider Staples Road Conservation Area is partially derived from its unaltered 19th century streetscape that features examples of unique architectural design. Additional planning constraints exist for the building in the form of an Article 4 Direction under the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995; this explicitly limits the "alteration of a dwelling house ... where any part of the enlargement, improvement or alteration would front the highway known as Staples Road."

Comments

The current proposal is considered to be UNACCEPTABLE. This is due to the resulting harm that the loss of this element would have on the significance (including setting) of the affected heritage assets (conservation area; LLB), contrary to paragraphs 206 and 207 of the NPPF (2021).

It is evident from the photo provided of the existing front door at Forest Lodge that it appears almost identical to that of its contemporary neighbour at Forest Villa. It is therefore considered likely that the door is original to the structure as designed by Beckett in the late 19th century, as noted above, which serves to add to the recognised significance of the site and of the door itself as one of a surviving pair. The existing door thus makes a positive contribution to the significance of the associated heritage assets. Furthermore, the existing door appears to be in good condition, both by visual assessment and as noted within the submitted Heritage Statement. As such, the proposed replacement of this significant element is not suitably supported by clear and convincing justification, as required by paragraph 200 of the NPPF.

Conclusion

It is concluded that the proposal would be inappropriate within its context and would fail to preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and its wider setting, as well as the setting of the non-designated heritage asset (Forest Villa), contrary to Policy DM7 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan 2011-2033 (2023) and the NPPF 2021.

For the reasons set out above having regard to all matters raised, it is recommended that planning permission be refused.

If you wish to discuss the contents of this report item please contact the case officer by 2pm on the day of the meeting at the latest, or if no direct contact can be made please email:

contactplanning@eppingforestdc.gov.uk

Case Officer: Muhammad Rahman | mrahman@eppingforestdc.gov.uk

Refusal Reason(s): (1)

- 1 The proposal would be inappropriate within its context and would fail to preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and its wider setting, as well as the setting of the non-designated heritage asset (Forest Villa), contrary to Policy DM7 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan 2011-2033 (2023) and the NPPF 2021.

Informatives: (2)

- 2 The Local Planning Authority has identified matters of concern within the officer's report and clearly set out the reason(s) for refusal within the decision notice. The Local Planning Authority has a formal post-application advice service. Please see the Councils website for guidance and fees for this service - <https://www.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/planning-and-building/apply-for-pre-application-advice/>. If appropriate, the Local Planning Authority is willing to provide post-application advice in respect of any future application for a revised development through this service.
- 3 This decision is made with reference to the following plan numbers: Location Plan, EX01, EX02, PR01, Front Door Specification, and Supporting Information.